

consensus



Confronting Social and Environmental Sustainability with Economic Pressure: Balancing Trade-offs by Policy Dismantling or Expansion?

CONSENSUS Coding Manual

This version: February 2009

Abstract

The CONSENSUS Coding Rules are used as handbook for coding environmental and social policy legislation in 24 selected OECD countries within the context of the CONSENSUS research project. It is based on “Deliverable 2: Quantitative Methodology Strategy” presented to the European Commission in July 2008. The authors acknowledge substantive comments by the project consortium on earlier drafts of the coding rules during the Aarhus project meeting in September 2008 as well as comments by the collaborators during the December 2008 meeting in Berlin.

Table of Contents

1. Background and purpose.....	4
2. Basic coding procedure and main concepts.....	5
3. Coding Categories.....	8
3.1 Coding Category 1: Policy Item.....	9
3.2 Coding Category 2: Policy instruments.....	14
3.3 Coding Category 3: Regulatory Level and Regulatory Scope.....	17
4. Examples for Coding Changes in Instruments, Levels and Scope.....	22
5. Coder Checklist.....	46
References.....	49
APPENDIX.....	50
A Bibliographical Information	51
B Data Spreadsheet.....	52
C Numerical Codes.....	60

1. Background and purpose

The main objective of the CONSENSUS project is to advance the understanding of public policy change by exploring the causes for cross-national and intertemporal variations in the extent and direction of policy change in public environmental and social policy in twenty-four OECD countries from 1976 to 2005.

To this end, the actual extent and direction of past environmental and social policy changes in the selected OECD countries has to be identified in the first place. In particular, it will be assessed whether and to what extent an expansion or dismantling of public environmental and social policies occurred in the countries and subfields under consideration. In generic terms, policy expansion in the environmental policy field comprises policy changes by which public environmental protection is tightened or made more demanding, whereas policy dismantling comprises policy changes, by which public environmental protection is relaxed or made less ambitious. As regards the social policy field, policy expansion comprises policy changes by which statutory social benefits and services are raised or extended, whereas policy dismantling comprises policy changes, by which statutory social benefits and services are lowered or cut back.

The assessment of policy change will be made on the basis of a comprehensive collection of legislation which has been compiled by acknowledged experts in each country. This collection encompasses all relevant national legal documents in three specific areas of environmental and social policy respectively: Clean Air Policy, Water Protection, and Nature Conservation as regards environmental policy; Unemployment Benefits, Old-Age Pensions, and Child Benefits in the social policy field. **This coding manual instructs the coders how to extract the relevant information from these legal documents, in order to receive solid data concerning the extent and direction of environmental and social policy change in OECD countries.**

The manual is structured as follows: The subsequent section briefly introduces the basic coding procedure as well as the related concepts and notions that are used in the CONSENSUS project for describing and assessing the extent and direction of policy change.¹ Section 3 then elaborates on the basic coding categories and thereby specifies and delimits the

¹ For a comprehensive introduction into the theoretical framework, the concepts, and notions in the CONSENSUS project, see “Deliverable 1: Theory Report”, <http://www.uni-konstanz.de/FuF/Verwiss/knill/consensus/wp-content/uploads/2008/08/deliverable1.pdf>.

coding subjects. Furthermore, it presents individual coding steps and gives concrete coding examples. The final section offers an elementary step-by-step coding checklist summarizing the coding rules and steps.

2. Basic coding procedure and main concepts

At the most basic level, the coders will have to identify single events of policy change in the collected legal documents and, for each single event, assess the direction of change, i.e., whether the single event of policy change represents **policy expansion or policy dismantling**.

In conceptual terms, CONSENSUS essentially seeks to measure policy change along two main dimensions: regulatory density and regulatory intensity.

Regulatory density describes the extent to which a certain policy area is covered by governmental activities, i.e. explicit regulatory action in the form of legal documents. Each introduction of a (new) policy item or of a (new) policy instrument is a single event of policy expansion contributing to change in the dimension of regulatory density. Analogously, each abolishment of an existing policy item or of an existing policy instrument is a single event of policy dismantling contributing to a change in this dimension. **More specifically, we divide regulatory density into two specific sub-dimensions: policy density – measured as the number of policy items that exist in a given policy area, and instrument density – measured as the number of policy instruments that exist in a given policy area.** If a new policy item or a new policy instrument is introduced, *ceteris paribus*, the number of policy items or of policy instruments increases (and thus the policy or instrument density). Consequentially, if the policy or instrument density increases, the regulatory density in environmental or social policy increases. If an existing policy item or an existing policy instrument is abolished, *ceteris paribus*, the number of policy items or of policy instruments decreases (and thus the policy or instrument density). If the policy or instrument density decreases, the overall regulatory density also decreases. **In short, each increase in regulatory density constitutes policy expansion, whereas each decrease in regulatory density constitutes policy dismantling.**

Regulatory intensity, by contrast, refers to the strictness or generosity of the measures and provisions adopted in the two policy fields. Each rise in the regulatory level and each

extension in the regulatory scope of an existing policy instrument is a single event of policy expansion, whereas each lowering in the regulatory level and each cut-back in the regulatory scope of an policy instrument is a single event of policy dismantling. If the regulatory level of an existing policy instrument is raised its regulatory scope is extended, ceteris paribus, the regulatory intensity increases. Analogously, if the regulatory level of an existing policy instrument is lowered or its regulatory scope is cut back, ceteris paribus, the regulatory intensity decreases. **In short, each increase in regulatory intensity constitutes policy expansion, whereas each decrease in regulatory intensity constitutes policy dismantling.** Table 1 below summarizes this approach to the measurement of policy change taken by CONSENSUS.

Table 1: The Measurement of Policy Change

Main Dimension	Sub-Dimension	Indicators
Regulatory Density	Policy Density	<u>Number</u> of policy items introduced or abolished in each year
	Instrument Density	<u>Number</u> of instruments introduced or abolished in each year
Regulatory Intensity	Substantial Intensity	<u>Number and/or degree</u> of changes in the regulatory levels increased or reduced in each year
		<u>Number and/or degree</u> of changes in the regulatory scope increased or reduced in each year

On the basis of the coding results a statistical analysis will be carried out that aggregates all these single events of policy change or, more precisely, of policy expansion and dismantling at a higher level of abstraction and ultimately allows assessing the general extent and direction of policy change in every single country as well as over time.

We strongly encourage the coders to **make use of relevant legal commentaries and/or textbooks before and whilst screening the legislation.** In many cases, this will help to reconstruct the basic legal history as well as to gain an elementary understanding of the developments in the two policy fields, providing the background for the fine-tuned coding. **For this kind of secondary sources, please provide bibliographic references in order to facilitate the crosschecking of the data (see APPENDIX A).**

To come into consideration, a policy change has to meet the following requirements in form and content. **Formally, a relevant policy change is any measure or provision in the collected legislation (and where necessary respective administrative circulars specifying these rules) that**

- **was published during the observation period, which starts on January 1, 1976, and ends on December 31, 2005 and**
- **was adopted at the national level (not regional or local level).**

This second point clearly excludes measures by sub-national jurisdictions such as regional or local bodies, even if the latter are state-like entities with far-reaching competencies as in federal states.

As regards the content, policy change refers to any measure or provision in any legal document of the collected legislation that

- pertains to any of the policy items included in the **closed policy item lists**, which were defined for each of the three specific policy areas in environmental and social policy respectively (see section 3.1), and that
- **involves at least one of the following eight consequences:**
 - (1) **introduction** of a policy item from the list or (2) **abolishment** of an existing policy item from the list;
 - (3) **introduction** of a new policy instrument or (4) **abolishment** of an existing policy instrument;
 - (5) **rise** in the regulatory level of an existing policy instrument or (6) **lowering** in the regulatory level of an existing policy instrument;
 - (7) **extension** of the regulatory scope of an existing policy instrument or (8) **cut-back** of the regulatory scope of an existing policy instrument.

Each of these consequences constitutes one single event of relevant policy change and can be interpreted as an individual instance, either of policy expansion or of policy dismantling.

3. Coding Categories

The method used in CONSENSUS to assess and code policy change, is intended to be universally applicable, i.e. over a wide range of countries, irrespective of differing legal and administrative traditions.

The coding rules comprise four invariant general categories:

- | | |
|----|---------------------|
| 1. | Policy Items |
| 2. | Instruments |
| 3. | Levels |
| 4. | Scope |

By means of these four categories, we seek to measure developments over time in the two policy fields (social and environmental policy) in a nuanced manner. In this context, **please keep in mind that the coding should be comprehensive**, i.e. it should comprise all legislative activities in each and every year of the observation period.

Moreover, in order to assess whether a change represents dismantling or expansion, **CONSENSUS is interested in policy change relative to the previous regulatory state**. Thus, as will be explained in more detail in this section, relative changes to the previous level in items, instruments, levels, and scope need to be coded.

We are interested in the introduction and abolishment of (new) policy items (guiding question: **what is regulated?**), of policy instruments (**how is something regulated?**), as well as in the tightening and relaxation of regulatory levels (**how intensely is something regulated?**) and regulatory scopes (**how encompassing is the regulation in terms of addressees?**).

Recalling the observation period (January 1, 1976 to December 31, 2005), this stated focus on change has one important implication: Although the relevant information for deciding whether a legal act falls into the observation period is the date of publication, **it might be the case that coders need to consult legislation originating from some year before 1976 in order to reconstruct the occurrence and the direction of change**. For instance, if a law adopted in 1978 changes a law enacted in 1956, the latter legislation has to be considered in order to make a statement about the direction and nature of change taking place through the

1978 legislation. **In such cases, please contact the project team that is responsible for the country in question.**

3.1 Coding Category 1: Policy Item

The first and most general coding category is “policy items”. For analytical reasons, we use a very narrow conception of policy item. By policy item, we mean a very specific activity within a subarea of a policy field guided by the question: who or what is regulated? **More specifically, a policy item is subject to state activities in order to achieve a political objective within a specific area. The tables below contain the policy items CONSENSUS is exclusively interested in.** Thus, when screening the legislative acts, please identify the presence and/or abolishment of any policy item from these lists and indicate these events of policy change as either expansion or dismantling.

If a policy item from the list is introduced for the first time, in other words subject to regulatory action for the first time, this particular event must be coded as policy expansion (code “1”).

If, by contrast, a policy item from the list is abolished, in other words is not subject to regulatory action anymore, this particular event must be coded as policy dismantling (code “2”).

It can, however, also occur that policy items prevail, although there is legislative change that affects policy instruments, regulatory levels or other aspects of the item in question. This event must be coded as prevalence of the status quo (code “0”).

For example, if a number of minor regulatory acts concerning environmental protection are, although formally abolished, in fact “only” subsumed in a new general act (such as an environmental code), the status quo *de facto* prevails and these events are assigned a zero. **The numerical codes for all events are repeated in the ANNEX.**

Environmental Policy Items:

In the field of environmental policy, we are interested in the following three subfields: **clean air policy, water protection policy, and nature conservation**. Based on this distinction, we defined different environmental policy items, which largely refer to the most common pollutants and regulatory activities in these areas. **We believe that an efficient way of coding environmental policy items is to look at the pollutants first, then to look at the specific context in which these pollutants are mentioned, and finally to evaluate the direction of policy change**. The following list contains the environmental policy items, which we are **exclusively** interested in. **Furthermore, it contains the numerical codes that the coders are asked to insert into the data collection matrix**.

Clean Air Policy

Air quality²

Policy Item	Numerical Code
Air quality standards for nitrogen oxides (NOx)	1
Air quality standards for sulphur dioxide (SO ₂)	2
Air quality standards for carbon monoxide (CO)	3
Air quality standards for particulate matter	4
Air quality standards for ozone	5
Air quality standards for lead	6

Emission limits (from stationary or mobile sources; product standards)³

Policy Item	Numerical Code
Nitrogen oxides (NOx) emissions from large combustion plants of the smallest size as defined by the legal act. Those are generally but not exclusively combustion plants with a thermal output of about 50 MW	7
Nitrogen oxides (NOx) emissions from passenger vehicles using unleaded gasoline	8
Nitrogen oxides (NOx) emissions from heavy vehicles destined for the transportation of goods using diesel	9
Sulphur dioxide (SO ₂) emissions from large combustion plants of the smallest size as defined by the legal act. Those are generally but not exclusively combustion plants with a thermal output of about 50 MW	10
Sulphur dioxide (SO ₂) emissions from passenger vehicles using unleaded gasoline	11
Sulphur dioxide (SO ₂) emissions from heavy vehicles destined for the transportation of goods using diesel	12
Carbon dioxide (CO ₂) emissions from large combustion plants of the smallest size as defined by the legal act. Those are generally but	13

² Selection based on <http://www.epa.gov/air/criteria.html>.

³ Selection based on Lovei (1998);

<http://eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=COM:2007:0844:FIN:EN:HTML>

not exclusively combustion plants with a thermal output of about 50 MW	
Carbon dioxide (CO ₂) emissions from passenger vehicles using unleaded gasoline	14
Carbon mono oxide (CO) emissions from large combustion plants of the smallest size as defined by the legal act. Those are generally but not exclusively combustion plants with a thermal output of about 50 MW	15
Carbon mono oxide (CO) emissions from passenger vehicles using unleaded gasoline	16
Particulate matter emissions from large combustion plants of the smallest size as defined by the legal act. Those are generally but not exclusively combustion plants with a thermal output of about 50 MW	17
Arsenic emissions from stationary sources	18
Maximum permissible limit for the lead content of petrol	19
Maximum permissible limit for the sulphur content of diesel	20

Water Protection

Water quality⁴

Policy Item	Numerical Code
Lead in continental surfaces water (i.e. waters that flow or which are stored on the surface, and include natural water channels like rivers, surface runoff, streams, lakes and others)	21
Copper in continental surfaces water	22
Nitrates in continental surfaces water	23
Phosphates in continental surfaces water	24
Zinc in continental surfaces water	25
Oils in continental surfaces water	26
Pesticides in continental surfaces water	27
DDT (Dichloro-Diphenyl-Trichloroethane) in continental surfaces water	28
Phenols in continental surfaces water	29
BOD (Biochemical Oxygen Demand) of continental surfaces water	30

Emission limits (from stationary or mobile sources; product standards)⁵

Policy Item	Numerical Code
Lead from industrial discharges from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water	31
Copper from industrial discharges from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water	32
Nitrates from industrial discharges from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water	33
Phosphates from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water	34
Chlorides from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water	35

⁴ Selection based on <http://www.oecd.org/dataoecd/52/44/38120922.pdf>

⁵ Selection based on Guderian and Gunkel (2000); talks with experts on water pollution technologies.

Sulphates from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water	36
Iron from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water	37
Zinc from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water	38
Oils and greases from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water	39
Pesticides and herbicides from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water	40
Phenols from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water	41
Coliform bacteria from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water	42
BOD (Biochemical Oxygen Demand) from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water	43
COD (Chemical Oxygen Demand) from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water	44

*Nature Conservation*⁶

Habitat

Policy Item	Numerical Code
Measures to protect native forests	45
The introduction / extension / reduction of nature protection areas/nature reserve	46

Flora

Policy Item	Numerical Code
The introduction / extension / reduction of import and export of regulations for endangered plants	47

Fauna

Policy Item	Numerical Code
The introduction / extension / reduction of import and export of regulations for endangered species	48

Social Policy Items:

In the field of social policy, we are interested in the following three policy subfields: **unemployment, old-age pensions, and child benefits**. Based on this distinction, we have defined different social policy items. The following list contains the social policy items, which we are **exclusively** interested in. In this context, it is crucial to underline that social policy items often consist of different “layers“ that must individually be recognized for the different countries. **To account for this complexity of social protection issues, we included terms such as “basic”, “additional“, or “special“, which clearly must clearly be interpreted in the corresponding national backgrounds.**

⁶ Selection based on Guderian (2001).

Unemployment Benefits⁷

Policy Item	Numerical Code
Basic Unemployment benefits	49
Special Unemployment benefits: bad weather; seasonal unemployment benefits	50
Special Unemployment benefits: emergency aid	51
Special Unemployment benefits: special holiday payments	52
Special Unemployment benefits: partial unemployment benefits	53
Special Unemployment benefits (Only to be considered if the more special forms of special unemployment benefits do not apply)	54
Unemployment fee/ contribution	55
Support for vocational education and training/ vocational reintegration expenses	56
Retention period (in case of quitting by the employee), i.e. a period of quarantine without benefits	57
Retention period (dismissal by the employer), i.e. a period of quarantine without benefits	58
Subsidized employment/ employment subsidies	59
Reimbursement of expenses related to active job search	60

Old-Age Pensions⁸

Policy Item	Numerical Code
People's Pension (standard-employee pension) for singles	61
People's Pension (standard-employee pension) for married couples	62
People's Pension (standard-employee pension) for unmarried couples	63
Additional People's Pension for singles (always depend on the national context; pensions originating from another source than the basic people's pension)	64
Additional People's Pension for married couples	65
Additional People's Pension for unmarried couples	66
Special Pensions for singles (always depend on the national context; e.g. pensions paid to old-aged people who retire earlier than the majority of the working population)	67
Special Pensions for married couples	68
Special Pensions for unmarried couples	69
Pension fee/ contribution for singles	70
Pension fee/ contribution for married couples	71
Pension fee/ contribution for unmarried couples	72

Child Benefits⁹

⁷ Selection based on initial empirical insights; www.sozialpolitik-aktuell.de ; Allan and Scruggs (2004).

⁸ Selection based on initial empirical insights; www.sozialpolitik-aktuell.de; Allan and Scruggs (2004).

⁹ Selection based on initial empirical insights; <http://www.direct.gov.uk/en/MoneyTaxAndBenefits/TaxCreditsandChildBenefit/Childbenefits/index.htm>

Ordinary Child Allowance	73
Special child allowance, e.g. special subsidy for juveniles having not reached majority (often 16-18 years)	74
Payments for giving birth to children	75
Tax exemptions	76

3.2 Coding Category 2: Policy instruments

We define a policy instrument as a **tool or means adopted to achieve the underlying regulatory objective** of the selected social or environmental policy items. A policy instrument thus describes the type of regulatory action adopted for a given policy item. A policy instrument is intended to have a regulating and/or guiding effect on people's actions.

The two tables below contain **all potential policy instruments for each of the two policy fields. For each policy item, if regulated, there is at least one policy instrument defined as a tool to achieve the regulatory objective.** Yet, any policy item may be regulated by means of various policy instruments (e.g. 'chlorides from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water' may be regulated by an obligatory standard as well as a tax system). For each regulated policy item, the coders are asked to **identify all instruments in place and indicate their type using the predefined numerical codes as given in the tables.**

Please note that a given **policy instrument belongs to one type/group only**. Thus, they should not assign more than one code to a policy instrument. Moreover, the category **“Other” should be used very sparingly**. In case of doubt, we encourage the coders to consult their coding instructors on this matter before assigning this residual category to any instrument.

Environmental Policy Instruments

The **following table is exhaustive** and contains the most common environmental policy instruments as well as the numerical codes that the coders are asked to include in the data compilation matrices. The codes refer to the generic terms. Note that when assigning the numerical codes between 101 and 112, those only specify the **type of instrument/instrument group**. Hence, within each legal act, you may still recognize and count various **variants of**

instruments that belong to the same type/group. In this sense, a legal act may, for instance, contain a prohibition on importation, a prohibition on exportation, a prohibition on sale as well as a prohibition on production of fluorochlorocarbons. Here, it is essential to note that **four instruments are in place**, which are, however, all assigned the numerical code 102 as they all represent a specific form of a ban. **In order to trace all changes, please be as specific as possible with the actual policy instruments and consider all variants of instruments, also and especially when belonging to the same instrument type/group.**

Instrument	Description	Examples	Code
Obligatory standard	A legally enforceable numerical standard, typically involving a measurement units, e.g. mg/l	Limit value for lead emissions in surface water, e.g. 50 mg/l	101
Prohibition/ ban	Total or partial prohibition/ ban on certain emissions, activities, products etc.	Ban on importation of products containing fluorchlorocarbons; ban on exportation of endangered species	102
Technological prescription	A measure prescribing the use of a specific technique or technology	best available technology', or 'best practicable means'	103
Tax/ levy	A tax or levy for a certain polluting product or activity	levy on the emission of a certain pollutant into surface waters, e.g. copper	104
Subsidy/ tax reduction	A measure by which the state grants a financial advantage to a certain product or activity	the use of less air-polluting cars	105
Liability scheme	A measure that allocates the costs of environmental damage to those who have caused the damage	"polluter pays principle"	106
Planning instrument	A measure defining areas or times deserving particular protection	zoning of activities around airports or sensitive ecosystems	107
Public investment	Specific public investment	Public investment for the research and development of	108

		new energy technologies; Investments in infrastructure	
Data collection / monitoring programmes	Specific programme for collecting data	monitoring of urban air quality in the context of an early warning system for photochemical smog; monitoring of the population of certain endangered species	109
Information based instrument	Exchange of information between the state and polluters or between polluters among themselves	pollutant release and transfer register	110
Voluntary instrument	Voluntary agreements or commitments between the state and private actors or by private actors alone	greenhouse reduction targets, e.g. a reduction of emissions by 10%	111
Other	Any instrument that cannot be assigned to the given categories		112

Social Policy Instruments

The **following table is exhaustive**, containing the most common social policy instruments and the numerical codes the coders are asked to include in the data compilation matrices. The codes refer to the generic terms. Again, when assigning the numerical codes between 201 and 207, the coders should make sure that those refer to the instrument type/group only. For each instrument group, different variants of instruments may be recognized in the legal acts. For example, a legal act may contain two variants of reimbursements of expenses related to job search (e.g. an instrument for reimbursements of travel expenses and an instrument for reimbursement of other material expenses). This entails that **two instruments are in place**, which are, however, both assigned the numerical code 206 as they represent a specific form of a reimbursement. **Please make sure to be as specific and inclusive as possible when coding policy instruments and their variants, also and especially when they belong to the same instrument type/group.**

Instrument	Description	Example	Code
Universal benefits/ Allowance	A payment of a certain amount of money by the state, irrespective of means	Unemployment benefit, Child benefit; orphan's benefit	201
Means-tested benefits	The entitlement depends on several factors, such as income	Single parent's benefit; youth subsidy	202
Contribution/ fee	Payment made by citizens to a state agency in order to receive certain benefits	Fee for unemployment insurance	203
Tax exemption/ subsidy	A reduction of tax payments in order to provide income tax savings	Child Tax Exemption	204
Bonus/ grant	one-off grant/ payment of money, irrespective of means	Bonus for giving birth to a child; reimbursement of expenses related to job search	205
Retention	Non-payment of a certain allowance	Retention period for unemployment benefit	206
Other	Any instrument that cannot be assigned to the given categories		207

3.3 Coding Category 3: Regulatory Level and Regulatory Scope

As concerns the following two dimensions, we additionally ask the coders to evaluate the degree of policy change. Details on the evaluation criteria are given below. Furthermore, we would like to underline that both the regulatory level and scope are often spelled out in detail in administrative circulars rather than laws. The coders may therefore need to pay particular attention to administrative circulars when working on this coding category.

Regulatory Level

Changes in the regulatory level refer to **the numerical level or calibration of the policy instruments** that are in place to regulate the policy items of interest (see list). This time, the

focus is thus on the numerical values of instrument levels guided by the question how intensely is something regulated? The coders are asked to pay particular attention to changes between **newly introduced and the existing numerical values**, for example old vs. new emission limits, as expressed in mg/l; or old vs. new levels of financial support given to beneficiaries in allowance schemes, as expressed in some monetary unit or percentage of previous salaries.

The particular degree of this kind of change, however, will be assessed by the Konstanz team once the data coding is finished. **To this end, the coders shall, if possible, report the exact numerical values of the regulatory levels (indicating both the previous and the new level), including the corresponding measurement units.**

In order to facilitate this assessment, the coding table, in which the coders document each single event of policy change, contains two columns referring to regulatory levels. The **first level column** should be filled in with the previously valid level. The **second level column** should be filled in with the newly introduced standard. By comparing these values, identifying events of policy change and their direction is straightforward. **The direction of change should then be indicated in the respective column by code “1” in case of policy expansion, and code “2” in case of policy dismantling. As we introduced closed item definitions, it is conceivable that the precise numerical value related to it does not change despite broader legislative changes. In this case, the coders shall insert a “0” for showing that for this particular policy item and instrument, the regulatory status quo remains.**

Expansion in the coding category of regulatory levels involves the tightening of regulatory levels, e.g. higher tax level or lower maximum permissible limits for industry emissions, or a higher generosity in terms of higher benefits, whereas dismantling corresponds to a loosening of regulatory levels, e.g. lower tax levels or higher maximum permissible limits for industry emissions, and a reduced level of generosity regarding the level of allowances. **Most likely, changes in levels are occurring more frequently than changes in the other two dimensions, i.e. policy items and policy instruments.** Consequently, the coding of this category of policy change may be the most challenging exercise. Since with regard to regulatory levels we are also interested in the magnitude of change, the coders should clearly state in the data table whether they have been introduced for the first time.

General remarks on coding the regulatory levels as regards environmental policy items

- Air quality standards generally use the following measurement units: ppm, mg/m³. The coders should always state the measurement unit. **If different measurement units are given, the coders can decide by themselves which one to report as long as this is done in a consistent manner and with the highest possible transparency.**
- Air quality standards are often given as average concentrations. **If several concentrations are given for different averaging time, the coders should always make reference to the shortest averaging time, i.e. if a limit value for the 8-hour averaging time and the 1-hour averaging time is given, the latter should be reported, i.e. the 1-hour averaging time.** Furthermore, the coders should always make clear which of the different averaging times is reported.
- Air emission standards generally use the following measurement units: ppm, g/km, mg/km. The coders should always state the measurement unit. **If different measurement units are given, the coders can decide by themselves which one to report as long as this is done in a consistent manner and with the highest possible transparency.**
- For some cases in air and water protection policy, we did not specify the precise type of industry. While in some countries, this differentiation between industry sectors may not apply at all, in other ones the emission limit values may well differ across the different sectors. If this is the case and we did not specify the particular industry sector, the coders shall report and compare the limit values for all industrial sectors. **This also entails that each of the different limit values for each industry sector is conceived as a single policy items and is therefore susceptible to policy change. Otherwise, the coders should strictly follow the definition of the policy items.**
- Water quality standards generally use the following measurement units: µg/l or mg/l. The coders should always state the measurement unit. **If different measurement units are given, the coders can decide by themselves which one to report as long as this is done in a consistent manner and with the highest possible transparency.**
- If several sub-categories of continental surface waters are given in the legal act, the value we are interested in are those for “**rivers**”.

- Water emission standards generally use the following measurement units: $\mu\text{g/l}$ or mg/l . The coders should always state the measurement unit. **If different measurement units are given, the coders can decide by themselves which one they are reporting as long as this is done in a consistent manner and with the highest possible transparency.**
- Water emission standards are often given as daily or monthly averages. **If several concentrations are indeed given, the coders should always make reference to the daily averages.** Nevertheless, the coders should always make clear which of the limit values they are reported.
- If several sub-categories of continental surface waters are given in the legal act, **the value we are interested in are those for “rivers”.**
- If within these restrictions, i.e. the value for daily average concentrations of pollutants emitted to continental surface water or more precisely rivers, **still several limit values are given, e.g. for different industries, all of them shall be reported and compared to one another.**
- **Some of the policy instruments do not involve a numerical regulatory level.** For instance, in the case of the polluter pays principle, it is sufficient to code the introduction of this liability scheme as such (i.e. a “1” for policy expansion when introduced for the first time as a regulatory tool with regard to one of the specified policy items) and code potential exemptions to this principle under the scope category introduced next.

General remarks on coding the regulatory level as regards of social policy items

- Typical measurement units: **monetary units, e.g. national currency or Euro, temporal units, e.g. days, percentages of tax reduction, percentages of the last salary**

Regulatory Scope

The regulatory scope refers to the cases, constellations, or addressees covered by a certain policy instrument under the guiding question: how encompassing is the regulation of an instrument? The coders should indicate if and to what extent a legal act implies changes

(reductions or increases) with regard to these different dimensions of regulatory scope (branches/ facilities/ products/ persons). **Generally speaking, we are looking for benchmarks (e.g. the size of power plants; conditions for receiving allowance) defining the cases, constellations, or addressees that are covered.** The scope of the regulations of specific pollutants emitted by passenger cars could either refer to all passenger cars or only to a subset of passenger cars, e.g. new cars, cars of a certain size etc. **Any broadening of the target of this particular regulation would be judged as a regulatory scope expansion. If however, the regulation is changed in a manner that limit values now only refer to new cars, this action would mean a regulatory scope dismantling.**

In a similar vein, the regulatory scope of child benefits could either include all families regardless of income and wealth or can only include low-income families. **If the refundable child tax credit is changed in a manner that it now applies to all families regardless of income and wealth, this would imply a regulatory scope expansion. It would however represent a case of dismantling in regulatory scope, if the refundable child tax credit regulation is modified and now given to low-income families only.**

To be sure, we are interested in the magnitude of changes in the regulatory scope. **Therefore, the coders should – if possible – indicate the changes in numerical values or other expressions indicating the degree of change.** As concerns the example given above, the coders could indicate the number as well as a short description of previously exempted groups (**in the first *scope* column**) and the number as well as a short description of those exemptions that apply along with the modification of the regulation (**in the second *scope* category**). In case that a policy item and/or instrument is **introduced for the first time, the coders should present this information in the data tables since this information is essential for assessing the magnitude of change.**

Analogously to the information provided with reference to the *regulatory level* categories we are interested in comparing the new range of covered addressees (second *scope* column) with the previous target group (first *scope* column) of a regulation. The specification of the target group can occur in both ways: **directly by reporting who is covered by a regulation and/or a certain regulatory level or indirectly by listing exemptions to a rule.** Therefore, coders should briefly name the target group or the single sub-groups and if applicable also state the number of exemptions as well as a short description of those cases in both *scope* columns respectively. **Subsequently, the direction of change in scope should be coded such that**

“1” is used to indicate policy expansion whereas “2” refers to policy reduction. Thus, increasing the number of addressees of a regulation or reducing the number/extent of exemptions on the one hand is interpreted as policy expansion. Reducing the target group, the number of targeted sub-groups or increasing the number/extent of exemptions on the other hand means policy reduction and should be coded accordingly. **Additionally, coders should make use of the *remarks* category to include the detailed source of information.** In the case of change in *scope*, this means for instance section, article, paragraph, sub-paragraph etc. Moreover, it is conceivable that the scope of the selected policy items and related instruments does not change despite broader legislative reforms. **In this case, the coders shall insert a “0” for showing that for this particular policy item and instrument, the regulatory scope remains unmodified.**

4. Examples for Coding Changes in Instruments, Levels and Scope

The following tables are intended to illustrate the *level* and *scope* categories by listing examples from different legal systems. **Again it is important to underline that the first introduction of a regulation always constitutes one event of positive policy change (i.e. policy expansion), regardless of the absolute value of the level or the number and/or extent of exempted groups.** In this case the columns indicating the previous level and scope would remain empty. **Yet, once a later reform of a legal act changes the regulatory level or scope of an existing instrument, it is essential to state the nature of change; in the case of a change in regulatory levels, this means indicating the previous and the new value. In the case of *regulatory scope* it is necessary to assess who is covered by the provision, i.e. for example how many exemptions to the regulation have been added or abolished or in what way the regulation has been extended to other industries, persons or polluters.** Based on this information, the coders should subsequently judge whether the observed event of change constitutes a reduction or expansion in levels and scope. If a regulation or a reform law refers to the items of interest (see above) by producing change in both dimensions – *level* and *scope* – coders should make sure to code modifications in both of these categories separately, hence to include two events of change.

The examples below show how the different instruments (listed earlier) find their application in regulating the items of interest. We also provide short descriptions of *levels* and *scope* where applicable. Please note that these levels refer to the examples and legal acts under study only. Thus, in coding practice, this information would be listed in the column indicating the

current level and current scope. Thus, in the following examples, we do not know the direction of change yet (i.e. whether there has been policy expansion or reduction). The tables in the ANNEX, however, provide examples that also indicate the direction of each change.

Environmental Policy: Level and Scope

In this section, we give examples for coding the regulatory levels and scope for each type of environmental policy instruments.

1. Obligatory standard

Example 1:

Country: Mexico

Legal Act: NOM-085-SEMARNAT-1994 referring to Atmospheric Contamination – fixed sources. For fixed sources that utilize solid, liquid, or gas combustible fossil fuels or any of their combinations, that establishes the maximum permissible levels of emission to the atmosphere of smoke, total suspended particulates, sulphur dioxides and nitrogen oxides and the requirements and conditions for the operation of the indirect heating equipment for combustion, as well as the maximum permissible levels of sulphur dioxide in the direct heating equipment for combustion.

Item: Sulphur dioxide (SO₂) emissions from large combustion plants (10)

Level: As the tables given below show, there are various limit values given for particulate matter (PARTICULAS), SO₂ (BIOXIDO DE AZUFRE) and NO_x. **As a rule, the coders should look at the smallest size of large combustion plants, which here equals 5,250 MJ/h (see CAPACIDAD DEL EQUIPO DE COMBUSTION).** For this size, no limit values are given for particulate matter (NA) as well as NO_x emissions. Hence, the coders only need to insert the limit values for SO₂ which, however, change according to the type of fuel used (TIPO DE COMBUSTIBLE EMPLEADO) and the different regions in the country (ZMCM, ZC, and RP). **The coders should give and compare all of these six limit values. Moreover, they should be explicit about the unit of measurement. Here the limit values are expressed as ppm and kg/10⁶ kcal. The coders can decide by themselves which of the two they can to report – it is merely important that they indicate which units they actually make reference to.**

TABLA 4.
1994 AL 31 DE DICIEMBRE DE 1997

CAPACIDAD DEL EQUIPO DE COMBUSTION MJ/h	TIPO DE COMBUSTIBLE EMPLEADO	DENSIDAD DEL HUMO Número de mancha u opacidad	PARTICULAS (PST) mg/m ³ (kg/10 ⁶ kcal)			BIOXIDO DE AZUFRE ppm V (kg/10 ⁶ kcal)			OXIDOS DE NITROGENO ppm V (kg/10 ⁶ kcal)			EXCESO DE AIRE DE COMBUSTION % volumen (4)
			ZMCM	ZC	RP	ZMCM	ZC (5)	RP	ZMCM	ZC (3)	RP	
Hasta 5,250	Combustible o gasóleo	4	NA	NA	NA	1100 (4.08)	2100 (7.80)	2600 (9.81)	NA	NA	NA	60
	Otros líquidos	3	NA	NA	NA	1100 (4.08)	2100 (7.81)	2600 (9.81)	NA	NA	NA	
	Gaseosos	0	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	
De 5,250 a 43,000	Líquidos	NA	100 (0.142)	425 (0.604)	600 (0.852)	1100 (4.08)	2100 (7.80)	2600 (9.81)	220 (0.588)	300 (0.801)	400 (1.203)	50
	Gaseosos	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	220 (0.563)	300 (0.767)	400 (1.023)	
De 43,000 a 110,000	Líquidos	NA	100 (0.142)	425 (0.604)	550 (0.781)	1100 (4.08)	2100 (7.81)	2600 (9.81)	180 (0.481)	300 (0.801)	400 (1.069)	40
	Gaseosos	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	180 (0.460)	300 (0.767)	400 (1.023)	
Mayor de 110,000	Sólidos	NA	70 (0.105)	325 (0.436)	435 (0.664)	1100 (4.32)	2100 (8.24)	2600 (9.81)	160 (0.449)	280 (0.785)	400 (1.122)	30
	Líquidos	NA	70 (0.039)	325 (0.462)	500 (0.710)	1100 (4.12)	2100 (7.81)	2600 (9.81)	160 (0.427)	280 (0.748)	400 (1.069)	
	Gaseosos	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	160 (0.409)	280 (0.716)	400 (1.023)	

Notas y significados de siglas en Anexo 1

TABLA 5.
1° ENERO DE 1998 EN ADELANTE

CAPACIDAD DEL EQUIPO DE COMBUSTION MJ/h	TIPO DE COMBUSTIBLE EMPLEADO	DENSIDAD DEL HUMO Número de mancha u opacidad	PARTICULAS (PST) mg/m ³ (kg/10 ⁶ kcal)			BIOXIDO DE AZUFRE ppm V (kg/10 ⁶ kcal)			OXIDOS DE NITROGENO ppm V (kg/10 ⁶ kcal)			EXCESO DE AIRE DE COMBUSTION % volumen (5)
			ZMCM	ZC (3)	RP	ZMCM	ZC (3)	RP	ZMCM	ZC (4)	RP	
Hasta 5,250	Combustible o gasóleo	3	NA	NA	NA	550 (2.04)	1,100 (4.08)	2,200 (8.16)	NA	NA	NA	50
	Otros líquidos	2	NA	NA	NA	550 (2.04)	1,100 (4.08)	2,200 (8.16)	NA	NA	NA	
	Gaseosos	0	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	
De 5,250 a 43,000	Líquidos	NA	75 (0.106)	350 (0.426)	450 (0.568)	550 (2.04)	1,100 (4.08)	2,200 (8.16)	190 (0.507)	190 (0.507)	375 (1.0)	40
	Gaseosos	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	190 (0.486)	190 (0.486)	375 (0.959)	
De 43,000 a 110,000	Líquidos	NA	60 (0.805)	300 (0.426)	400 (0.568)	550 (2.04)	1,100 (4.08)	2,200 (8.16)	110 (0.294)	110 (0.294)	375 (1.0)	30
	Gaseosos	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	110 (0.281)	110 (0.281)	375 (0.959)	
Mayor de 110,000	Sólidos	NA	60 (0.090)	250 (0.375)	350 (0.525)	550 (2.16)	1,100 (4.31)	2,200 (8.16)	110 (0.309)	110 (0.309)	375 (1.052)	25
	Líquidos	NA	60 (0.085)	250 (0.355)	350 (0.497)	550 (2.04)	1,100 (4.08)	2,200 (8.16)	110 (0.294)	110 (0.294)	375 (1.0)	
	Gaseosos	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	110 (0.281)	110 (0.281)	375 (0.959)	

Notas y significados de siglas en Anexo 1

Fortunately, this particular legal act already contains a moment of policy change as the first table refers to the period from 1994 to 1997. From January 1, 1998 onwards, new limit values are in place. Those are notably tighter, thus representing policy expansion. **Attention: Since the decision for this kind of**

expansion has already been taken in 1994, this change must temporally also be assigned to the year 1994. NOM-085-SEMARNAT-1994 has been predated by the technical standards NTE-CCAT-005/88, NTE-CCAT-007/88, NTE-CCAT-008/88 as well as NOM-CCAT-019-ECOL/1993, which are not reported here.

However, since it is the aim to trace **policy change**, those acts need to be coded as well. Moreover, the coders' interpretation of policy expansion must be based on the previous legislation. In this particular, it is safe to state that the limit values defined by **NOM-085-SEMARNAT-1994 represent 12 events of policy expansion due to tightening limit values. Of these, 6 can be read from table 1 and the other 6 from table 2.**

Scope: In this particular case, the three different regions in the country (ZMCM, ZC, and RP) indicate the scope of the measures. This implies that the limit values are limited to each of the three regions defined. **Defining universal limit values for the entire country would represent an event of scope expansion, whereas defining additional regions with separate limit values would represent an event of policy reduction.** Based on this logic, defining **individual limit values for industry sectors would also correspond to scope reduction since the number of addressees becomes smaller.** This is, however, a hypothetical example to shed further light on the logic behind this coding category. **In more concrete terms, the coders should make clear that there are different limit values for three different regions.**

Example 2:

Country: Germany

Legal Act: 13th Decree for the implementation of the Federal Immission Control Act (1983)

Item: Nitrogen oxides (NO_x) emissions from large combustion plants (7)

Level: § 5(1) specifies limit values for NO_x emissions from large combustion plants using non-liquid combustibles (e.g. coal and wood). The level, i.e. the maximum permissible amount of emissions is set to **800 mg per m³ exhaust.**

Scope: Combustion plants with a combustion capacity of 50 Megawatts or more. Excluded are: waste incineration plants, coke oven underfirings, gas turbines, and post-combustion systems.

Example 3:

Country: Switzerland

Legal Act: Luftreinhalte-Verordnung (LRV) vom 16. Dezember 1985 (http://www.admin.ch/ch/d/sr/c814_318_142_1.html)

Item: Nitrogen oxides (NO_x) emissions, Carbon mono oxide (CO) emissions, and Sulphur dioxide (SO₂) emissions from large combustion plants (7, 15, 10)

Level: The following tables specify emission limits for NO_x , CO and SO_2 from stationary sources. Combustion of “extra light fuel oil” is regulated by emission limits for CO and NO_x (two items). Combustion of “medium and heavy fuel oils” is regulated by emission limits for CO, SO_2 and NO_x (three items). Combustion of “coal, coal briquets and coke” is regulated by emission limits for CO, SO_2 and NO_x (three items). Combustion of “wood combustibles” is regulated by emission limits for CO and NO_x (two items). Combustion of “gas combustibles” is regulated by emission limits for CO and NO_x (two items).

In sum, 12 items can be found in the LRV regulating the emissions from stationary sources. Therefore, the LRV constitutes 12 potential instances of change (in case all the numerical values differ from their previous values).

<i>Feuerungen für Heizöl «Extra leicht»</i>				
- Bezugsgrösse: Die Grenzwerte für die gasförmigen Schadstoffe beziehen sich auf einen Sauerstoffgehalt im Abgas von				3 % vol
- Russzahl				
a. Feuerungen mit Gebläseburnern				1
b. Feuerungen mit Verdampfungsburnern				2
- Kohlenmonoxid (CO)				
a. Feuerungen mit Gebläseburnern				80 mg/m ³
b. Feuerungen mit Verdampfungsburnern mit Ventilator				150 mg/m ³
- Stickoxide (NO_x), angegeben als Stickstoffdioxid				
a. bei den in Artikel 20 aufgeführten Anlagen				120 mg/m ³
b. bei Feuerungen mit einer Feuerungswärmeleistung über 350 kW:				
- bei einer Heizmediumtemperatur bis 110° C				120 mg/m ³
- bei einer Heizmediumtemperatur über 110° C				150 mg/m ³
- Ammoniak und Ammoniumverbindungen, angegeben als Ammoniak ¹				30 mg/m ³

		Feuerungswärmeleistung		
		über 5 MW bis 50 MW	über 50 MW bis 100 MW	über 100 MW
<i>Heizöl «Mittel» und «Schwer»</i>				
- Bezugsgrösse: Die Grenzwerte beziehen sich auf einen Sauerstoffgehalt im Abgas von	%vol	3	3	3
- Feststoffe insgesamt: für Heizöle mit einem Schwefelgehalt von höchstens 1 % (Masse):	mg/m ³	80	10	10
für übrige Heizöle	mg/m ³	50	10	10
- Kohlenmonoxid (CO)	mg/m ³	170	170	170
- Schwefeloxide (SO_x), angegeben als Schwefeldioxid (SO_2)	mg/m ³	1700	1700	400
- Stickoxide (NO_x), angegeben als Stickstoffdioxid (NO_2)	mg/m ³	150	150	150
- Ammoniak und Ammoniumverbindungen, angegeben als Ammoniak	mg/m ³	30	30	30

		Feuerungswärmeleistung					
		bis 70 kW	über 70 kW bis 500 kW	über 500 kW bis 1 MW	über 1 MW bis 10 MW	über 10 MW bis 100 MW	über 100 MW
<i>Kohle, Kohlebriketts, Koks</i>							
– Bezugsgrösse: Die Grenzwerte beziehen sich auf einen Sauerstoffgehalt im Abgas von							
	%vol	7	7	7	7	7	7
– Feststoffe insgesamt:							
– ab 1. September 2007	mg/m ³		150	150	50	10	10
– ab 1. Januar 2008	mg/m ³	–	150	150	20	10	10
– ab 1. Januar 2012	mg/m ³	–	50	20	20	10	10
– Kohlenmonoxid (CO)	mg/m ³	4000	1000	1000	150	150	150
– Schwefeloxide (SO _x), angegeben als Schwefeldioxid (SO ₂)							
– Wirbelschichtfeuerungen	mg/m ³	–	–	–	350	350	350
– andere Feuerungen bei Einsatz von Steinkohle	mg/m ³	–	–	–	1300	1300	400
– sonstige Anlagen	mg/m ³	–	–	–	1000	1000	400
– Stickoxide (NO _x), angegeben als Stickstoffdioxid (NO ₂)							
	mg/m ³	–	–	–	500	200	200
– Ammoniak und Ammoniumverbindungen, angegeben als Ammoniak ¹							
	mg/m ³	30	30	30	30	30	30

		Feuerungswärmeleistung				
		bis 70 kW	über 70 kW bis 500 kW	über 500 kW bis 1 MW	über 1 MW bis 10 MW	über 10 MW
<i>Holzbrennstoffe</i>						
– Bezugsgrösse: Die Grenzwerte beziehen sich auf einen Sauerstoffgehalt im Abgas von						
	%vol	13	13	13	11	11
– Feststoffe insgesamt:						
– ab 1. September 2007	mg/m ³	–	150	150	20	10
– ab 1. Januar 2008	mg/m ³	–	150	20	20	10
– ab 1. Januar 2012	mg/m ³	–	50 ¹	20	20	10
– Kohlenmonoxid (CO):						
– für Holzbrennstoffe nach Anh. 5 Ziff. 3 Abs. 1 Bst. a und b						
– ab 1. September 2007	mg/m ³	4000 ²	1000	500	250	150
– ab 1. Januar 2012	mg/m ³	4000 ²	500	500	250	150
– für Holzbrennstoffe nach Anh. 5 Ziff. 3 Abs. 1 Bst. c						
– ab 1. September 2007	mg/m ³	1000	1000	500	250	150
– ab 1. Januar 2012	mg/m ³	1000	500	500	250	150
– Stickoxide (NO _x) angegeben als Stickstoffdioxid (NO ₂)						
	mg/m ³	3	3	3	3	150
– gasförmige organische Stoffe, angegeben als Gesamtkohlenstoff (C)						
	mg/m ³	–	–	–	–	50
– Ammoniak und Ammoniumverbindungen, angegeben als Ammoniak ⁴						
	mg/m ³	–	–	–	30	30

Feuerungen für Gasbrennstoffe

- Bezugsgrösse: Die Grenzwerte beziehen sich auf einen Sauerstoffgehalt im Abgas von	3 % vol
- Kohlenmonoxid (CO):	
a. bei den in Artikel 20 Absatz 1 Buchstabe a–d aufgeführten Anlagen	100 mg/m ³
b. bei Feuerungen mit einer Feuerungswärmeleistung über 350 kW:	100 mg/m ³
- Stickoxide (NO _x), angegeben als Stickstoffdioxid (NO ₂):	
a. bei den in Artikel 20 Absatz 1 Buchstabe a–d aufgeführten Anlagen	
- atmosphärische Brenner mit einer Feuerungswärmeleistung bis 12 kW	120 mg/m ³
- übrige Anlagen	80 mg/m ³
b. bei Feuerungen mit einer Feuerungswärmeleistung über 350 kW:	
- Heizmediumtemperatur bis 110 ^o C	80 mg/m ³
- Heizmediumtemperatur über 110 °C	110 mg/m ³
- Ammoniak und Ammoniumverbindungen, angegeben als Ammoniak ¹	30 mg/m ³

Scope: Facilities for space heating, for generation of process heat, for generation of hot water, for steam generation

Example 4:

Country: Switzerland

Legal Act: Luftreinhalte-Verordnung (LRV) vom 16. Dezember 1985 (see above)

Item: Maximum permissible limit for the sulphur content of diesel (20)

Level: The LRV specifies limit values for sulphur in diesel and petrol of 10 mg/kg for both types of combustibles (2 items).

Scope: no exemptions

Typical Measurement Units of Obligatory Standards

ppm, mg/l, kg/10⁶ kcal, mg/m³, mg/kg

2. Prohibition / Ban

Example 1:

Country: Australia

Legal Act: Fuel Quality Standards Act 2000

Item: Maximum permissible limit for the lead content of petrol (19)

Level: The Act states a prohibition of the supply of leaded petrol by 1 January 2002. Thus, it must be coded as one event of complete prohibition and therefore as one event of policy expansion in the year 2000.

Scope: no exemptions

Example 2:

Country: Switzerland

Legal Act: Luftreinhalte-Verordnung (LRV) vom 16. Dezember 1985 (see above)

Item: Maximum permissible limit for the lead content of petrol (19), Maximum permissible limit for the sulphur content of diesel (20)

Level: The legal act (Art. 22) states the prohibition to import combustibles (petrol or diesel) that do not fulfil domestic quality standards (e.g. whose sulphur content exceeds 10 mg/kg for both petrol or diesel oil or if lead in petrol exceeds 0,005 g/kg).

Scope: no exemptions

Typical Measurement Units of Prohibitions/Bans

A ban/prohibition refers to a binary level (in place or not) or specifies a limit value of 0,000, e.g. g/l. Exemptions from a ban have to be specified in the SCOPE dimension.

Specific remarks

In the case of the prohibition of lead in petrol, the legal acts may either state this or define the limit value of 0.005g/l, which also indicates a prohibition according to international standards for lead content in fuel.

3. Technological prescription

Example 1:

Country: United States of America

Legal Act: Clean Water Act 1990

Item: All Water Protection Items (Codes 21-44)

Level: The Clean Water Act requires issuance of national industrial wastewater discharge regulations, which are based on the **best available technology**. Since the term constitutes moving targets on practices as techniques may change, the very first introduction of the best available technology principle must be coded **as one event of policy expansion**. However, the repeated mentioning of this principle merely indicate the prevalence of the status quo, whereas a removal of this principle would clearly indicate policy dismantling.

Scope: no exceptions (regional or sectoral)

Example 2:

Country: Germany

Legal Act: 13th Decree for the implementation of the Federal Immission Control Act

Item: Nitrogen oxides (NOx) emissions from large combustion plants (7)

Level: §5(1) states that possibilities of limiting NOx emissions from large combustion plants by use of best available technologies have to be exploited.

Scope: Combustion plants with a combustion capacity of 50 Megawatts or more. Excluded are: waste incineration plants, coke oven underfirings, gas turbines, and post-combustion systems.

Typical Measurement Units of Technological Prescriptions

Best practicable means; best available technology; technical specification of certain components and/or positioning of components

Specific remarks

The coders should make sure that merely the introduction/ removal but not the preservation of technical prescriptions are counted as events of policy change

4. Tax / Levy

Example 1:

Country: Germany

Legal Act: Wastewater Levy Act 1976

Item: All water protection items concerning emission limits (Codes 31-44)

Level: The act defines that from 1980 onwards, each polluter for each polluting unit must pay the following levies for discharging wastewaters

- | | |
|-------------------------|----------------------|
| – until January 1, 1981 | 12 DM (German Mark), |
| – from January 1, 1982 | 18 DM, |
| – from January 1, 1983 | 24 DM, |
| – from January 1, 1984 | 30 DM, |
| – from January 1, 1985 | 36 DM, |
| – from January 1, 1986 | 40 DM, |
| – from January 1, 1991 | 50 DM, |
| – from January 1, 1993 | 60 DM, |

- from January 1, 1997 70 DM,
- from January 1, 2002 35, 79 Euro.

Again, since the progressive increase of the levies has already been defined in 1976, this implies ten events of policy expansion in the year 1976.

Scope: Exemptions: §10(1) - §10(5) specifies exemptions that need to be compared with the previous level.

Example 2:

Country: Germany

Legal Act: Fees Decree for the Federal Nature Conservation Act

Item: The introduction/extension/reduction of import and export of regulations for endangered plants (47), The introduction/extension/reduction of import and export of regulations for endangered species (48)

Level: The Decree specifies fees for the importation and importation of protected species. Fees are given in national currency (German Mark – DM).

Scope: Exemptions are given in §3(1)-§3(3) and need to be compared with the previous level

Example 3:

Country: Switzerland

Legal Act: Bundesgesetz über die Reduktion der CO₂-Emissionen (CO₂-Gesetz) vom 8. Oktober 1999 (http://www.admin.ch/ch/d/sr/c641_71.html)

Item: Carbon dioxide (CO₂) emissions from large combustion plants (13)

Level: The legal act (Art. 7) introduces a CO₂ tax for extraction and import of coal and fossil fuels if used for energy generation (the eventual amount which is to be determined by the Federal Council must not exceed 210 CHF/tonne).

Scope: Art. 9 specifies exemptions that need to be compared to the previous level.

Typical Measurement Units of Taxes/Levies

National currency, e.g. US \$, German Mark, Pesos; CHF/tonne (national currency per mass)

5. Subsidy / Tax Reduction

Example 1:

Country: Germany

Legal Act: Gesetz zur Fortführung der ökologischen Steuerreform vom 16. Dezember 1999 (BGBl. I S. 2432)

Item: Carbon dioxide (CO₂) emissions from large combustion plants (13)

Level: The legal act implies complete energy tax exemption for gas and steam power plants. As this tax reduction favours environmentally friendly technologies over more polluting power plants, it must be conceived of as an event of environmental policy expansion rather than dismantling.

Scope: addressees: gas and steam power plants (electricity production) for five years

Typical Measurement Units of Subsidies/Tax Reductions

Industries/plants covered; period of interest (during which the rule is valid); degree to which the instrument applies (total/partial exemption etc.); groups of vehicles that fall under the rule; technical specification and performance criteria of components in order to be eligible etc.

Specific remarks

You need to know the ‘official’ objective of the tax for which exemptions are stated (in order to judge if the case is relevant and falls under the list of items of interest); e.g. the German energy tax has the goal of reducing pollution and emissions (including in particular those listed in the item list): exempting less polluting/more efficient technologies (gas and steam power plants) from the tax, makes ‘dirty’ industries comparatively more costly.

6. Liability scheme

Example 1:

Country: Canada

Legal Act: Canadian Environmental Protection Act 1999

Item: All emission items related to air (codes 7-18) and all emission items related to water (31-44)

Level: not applicable (na); The act states that the government of Canada recognizes the responsibility of users and producers in relation to toxic substances and pollutants and wastes, and has adopted the “polluter pays” principle. In environmental law, the **polluter pays principle** is the principle that the party responsible for producing pollution should also be responsible for paying for the damage done to the natural environment. As a result, the introduction of the polluter pays principle represents an event of expansion (a new policy instrument). **However, the repeated mentioning of this principle merely**

indicate the prevalence of the status quo, whereas a removal of this principle would clearly indicate policy dismantling.

Scope: not applicable (na)

Example 2: Emission Trading

Country: Germany

Legal Act: Gesetz über den Handel mit Berechtigungen zur Emission von Treibhausgasen (Treibhausgas-Emissionshandelsgesetz - TEHG) 2004

Item: All items related to green house gas emissions (codes 7-16)

Level: not applicable (na); The act establishes an emission trading system that allows for a cost-efficient reduction of greenhouse gases. Following the logic of these coding instructions, the establishment of this system introduces one new policy instrument regulating CO² emissions (a liability scheme) and must be coded accordingly (expansion). Later changes to this system do not mean an expansion in instruments.

Scope: Combustion plants (from energy and industrial sectors).

Exemptions: plants that conduce to research, development or testing of new charge materials, fuels, and products or procedures on the laboratory or technical scale. Waste combustion plants that use renewable energies or mine gas only.

Typical Measurement Units of Liability Schemes

Binary Coding: Extended polluter responsibility, liability scheme, emission trading system

Specific remarks

The coders should make sure that merely the introduction/ removal but not the preservation of liability schemes are counted as events of policy change.

7. Planning instrument

Example 1:

Country: New Zealand

Legal Act: Reserves Act 1977

Item: The introduction/extension/reduction of nature protection areas/nature reserve (46)

Level: not applicable (na); The act introduces provisions for protective covenants over

natural areas in private ownership, implying an event of policy expansion.

Scope: not applicable (na)

Typical Measurement Units of Planning Instruments

Binary Coding: existence of planning instruments

8. Data Collection / Monitoring Programmes
--

Example 1:

Country: Germany

Legal Act: 11th Decree for the implementation of the Federal Immission Control Act

Item: Nitrogen oxides (NO_x) emissions from large combustion plants (7)

Level: The decree specifies comprehensive annual reporting requirements for operators of industrial plants and combustion plants. It also specifies special reporting requirements in cases of exceedance of limit values (levels), particularly NO_x emissions higher than 250 kg/week.

Scope: No exemptions

Example 2:

Country: Switzerland

Legal Act: Luftreinhalte-Verordnung (LRV) vom 16. Dezember 1985 (see above)

Item: All items regarding emissions from large combustion plants into the air (codes 7, 10, 13, 15, 17)

Level: The LRV specifies rules and regulations regarding measurement and monitoring of emissions from large combustion plants and their compliance with existing limit values. In general, combustion plants (fossil fuels) are supposed to be conducted every two years (Art. 13); the first measurement should be made no later than 12 months after the start of operation; the monitoring process needs to be executed or supervised by a governmental institution.

Scope: combustion plants, no exemptions

Typical Measurement Units of Data Collection/Monitoring Programmes

Time specification (e.g. annual/monthly/weekly reports); reporting requirements for specific exceedances (e.g. measured in mass flow such as 250 kg/week); number of tolerated exceedances within a certain period; reporting requirements for exceedances

Specific remarks

This category clearly implies that the government obliges the pollutants to report their emission loads. In other words, monitoring and data collection must explicitly be specified as an obligation.

9. Information Based instrument

Example 1:

Country: Mexico

Legal Act: Mexican act on pollutant release and transfer register 2004

Item: Arsenic emissions from stationary sources (18), Lead from industrial discharges from industrial discharges (31)

Level: This act is listing industrial plants and their emissions of 104 different toxic chemicals to the air, water and land. The reporting of the polluting activities and the emissions is compulsory. Generally, acts like the Mexican have substance lists (see below). The coders shall look for the substances defined as policy items by these coding instructions and indicate whether they are covered by the reporting requirement or not. The addition of one relevant substance implies one event of policy expansion, whereas the removal of one means one event of policy dismantling. **However, the repeated mentioning of the substances merely indicates the prevalence of the status quo and should not be counted as policy change.**

Name	CAS No.
Mercury	
Cadmium	
Arsenic	
Hexavalent chromium compounds	
Lead	
Tetraethyl lead	78-00-2

Scope: No exemptions

Typical Measurement Units of Information Based Instruments

Temporal Units; reporting requirements - yearly, monthly, weekly, daily provision of information

10. Voluntary Instrument

Example 1:

Country: Switzerland

Legal Act: Bundesgesetz über die Reduktion der CO₂-Emissionen (CO₂-Gesetz) vom 8. Oktober 1999 (see above)

Item: Carbon dioxide (CO₂) emissions from large combustion plants (13), Carbon dioxide (CO₂) emissions from passenger vehicles (14)

Level: This act encourages voluntary plans and measures by industries to lower emissions of CO₂, so that the eventual degree of pollution remains within the objectives specified by the government.

Scope: no exemptions

Typical Measurement Units

Conditions for/coverage of voluntary instruments (industries that are covered by the exemption, interplay with other instruments etc.)

Social Policy: Level and Scope

In this section, we give examples for coding the regulatory levels and scope for each type of social policy instruments.

1. Allowance

Example 1:

Country: Switzerland

Legal Act: Bundesgesetz vom 25. Juni 1982 über die obligatorische Arbeitslosenversicherung und die Insolvenzenschädigung (Arbeitslosenversicherungsgesetz, AVIG) (http://www.admin.ch/ch/d/sr/c837_0.html)

Item: Basic Unemployment Benefits (49)

Level: The law specifies the conditions under which unemployed persons receive the full (i.e. **80%**) or the reduced (**70%**) amount of their previously earned daily income (there is a precise definition for the calculation of ‘daily income’). In general, unemployed persons are entitled to receive 5 daily allowances per week. Hence, there are **two** different levels for this category.

Scope: The first group covers those unemployed persons that bear responsibility for children under age 18. The second group covers all those persons that do not have any obligation to support children, those whose ‘daily allowance’ would otherwise exceed CHF 140, and those that are not disabled (see Art. 22). Moreover, there is a limit of daily allowances that a person is entitled to receive in a row. This number ranges between 260 and 520 daily allowances according to the person’s contribution period and other factors (see Art. 27 for eligibility criteria).

Note that changes in the time period someone is entitled to benefits represent a change the regulatory level, not scope, as such a change influences the overall amount of potential benefits.

Change in scope in this case might occur for example as concerns the extension of the period in certain geographical regions. Consider for instance *Ordonnance sur l’assurance-chômage obligatoire et l’indemnité en cas d’insolvabilité (Ordonnance sur l’assurance-chômage, OACI) du 31 août 1983* (http://www.admin.ch/ch/f/rs/c837_02.html). The latter modifies the retention period levels for unemployed persons for different cantons (thus changing the scope of the regulation). It establishes three temporary exemptions from the underlying regulation that locates the maximum number of daily allowances between 260 and 520 (according to eligibility). In the Cantons of Genève, Neuchâtel region, and Vaud region unemployed persons aged 50 or more are entitled to receive 120 daily allowances in addition to the maximum number they are normally entitled to receive (see above).

Example 2:

Country: Switzerland

Legal Act: Bundesgesetz vom 25. Juni 1982 über die obligatorische Arbeitslosenversicherung und die Insolvenzenschädigung (Arbeitslosenversicherungsgesetz, AVIG) (http://www.admin.ch/ch/d/sr/c837_0.html)

Item: Special Unemployment Benefits: bad weather (50)

Level: The law states that compensation for temporary loss of employment due to **bad weather** amounts to **80%** of their previously earned 'daily income' (again people are entitled to receive 5 daily allowances per week).

Scope: Persons that are unemployed due to bad weather are entitled to receive compensation during a maximum of 24 weeks (or 6 months, Art. 44) within a period of two years. However, this limit may not be exceeded by the sum of both, bad weather and partial unemployment benefits (Art. 44).

Example 3:

Country: Switzerland

Legal Act: Bundesgesetz vom 25. Juni 1982 über die obligatorische Arbeitslosenversicherung und die Insolvenzenschädigung (Arbeitslosenversicherungsgesetz, AVIG) (http://www.admin.ch/ch/d/sr/c837_0.html)

Item: Support for vocational education and training (56)

Level: The legal act states that vocational education and training of unemployed persons and those that are threatened by unemployment is to be supported financially and organizationally. This can occur both by participation at centrally organized courses or by independent initiatives. If approved by the responsible agency, applicants receive **daily allowances** whose amount is to be determined by the Federal Council (Art. 59). See Art. 60-64.

Scope: Persons participating in a job-training program, in which no more than 40% of the program is dedicated to education/training are eligible for daily allowances. The amount of daily allowances is proportional to the degree of employment. Art. 59d regulates eligibility for persons that do not fulfil the general eligibility criteria for coverage.

Example 4:

Country: Switzerland

Legal Act: Bundesgesetz vom 20. Dezember 1946 über die Alters- und Hinterlassenenversicherung (AHVG) (http://www.admin.ch/ch/d/sr/c831_10.html)

Background note: The legal act specifies the pension formula for the monthly benefit that consists of a defined amount (the so-called 'minimum amount') and a

variable component that is based on the yearly income of the insured person. Thus, the amount and share of each of the two components depend on the previously earned annual income of the person and the defined value of the ‘minimum amount’. Eventually, legal dispositions are such that insured persons receive a monthly payment of at least the ‘minimum amount’. The maximum benefit is limited to twice the value of the ‘minimum amount’.

Item: People’s pension (standard-employee pension) (61)

Level: The legal act defines a ‘minimum amount’ of 550 CHF, such that the standard pension for all insured persons ranges between CHF 550 and CHF 1100 (Art. 34).

Scope: Art. 18 specifies entitlement for pension payments: Swiss citizens and residents and under certain circumstances foreigners (not residing in Switzerland any more) that have paid contributions for a certain period; women aged 64 or older; men aged 65 or older.

Example 5:

Country: Switzerland

Legal Act: Bundesgesetz über Ergänzungsleistungen zur Alters-, Hinterlassenen- und Invalidenversicherung (ELG) vom 6. Oktober 2006¹ (Stand am 1. Januar 2009) (http://www.admin.ch/ch/d/sr/c831_30.html)

Item: Additional people’s pension (64)

Level: The legal act states the right to receive additional payments and support schemes for persons receiving public pensions. Additional aid is granted in case expenses are higher than income (from the pension). Art. 10 specifies recognized expenses defining (and increasing) expected costs of living for solitary persons to CHF 18140 annually; expected rental charges amount to CHF 13200. So eventually there might be a larger difference between expected expenses and received payment (through pension benefits), which might lead to higher additional payments.

Scope: Persons that receive public pensions and whose expenses are higher than their income (through the pension scheme).

Example 6:

Country: Switzerland

Legal Act: Bundesgesetz vom 20. Dezember 1946 über die Alters- und Hinterlassenenversicherung (AHVG) (http://www.admin.ch/ch/d/sr/c831_10.html)

Item: Special pensions (67)

Level: The legal act requires special pensions to be equal to the ‘minimum amount’ (in this case of 550 CHF).

Scope: Entitled to special pensions are all those persons listed above (i.e. in Art. 18) but that do not have paid contributions for one entire year (thus not having a reference income for the calculation of the monthly pension benefit). This regulation also applies to surviving dependants.

Example 7:

Country: Denmark

Legal Act: Child Subsidy and Family Benefit's Act (Lov om børnetilskud og andre familieydelse) (1967/236 as of 1976/531), June 2th 1967. Hard copy.

Item: Special child allowance (Orphans) (74)

Level: Amount set in legislation to 3.336 DKK/year with one parent deceased or 'missing', 5.520 DKK/ year with both parents; amount index-regulated. Regulations specify the exact amount.

Scope: Parents or custodians of children 0-16 with one or two deceased parents. Given when either:
(1) Both parents deceased
(2) Father id unknown
(3) Only one parent is alive
(4) When children with deceased parent, who have raised the child, is adopted by a single.
(5) When only parent receives pension because the pension of the other parents is withheld.

Example 8:

Country: Finland

Legal Act: Child Benefit's Act (Barnbidragslag) (1992/796), August 21st 1992.
<http://www.finlex.fi/sv/laki/alkup/1992/19920796>

Item: Child benefit – a general child allowance (73)

Level: Amounts set in legislation according to number of children below the age of 16, for the:

First child:	366 FIM/month
Second child:	413 FIM/month
Third child:	512 FIM/month
Fourth child:	645 FIM/month
Fifth and each following child:	842 FIM/month
Amounts are index-regulated.	Regulations specify the exact amount.

Scope: Parents or custodians for children 0-16 years of age.

Example 9:

Country: Finland

Legal Act: Child Benefit's Act (Barnbidragsslag) (1992/796), August 21st 1992.
<http://www.finlex.fi/sv/laki/alkup/1992/19920796>

Item: Prolonged child benefit – a youth subsidy (74)

Level: Set to 366 FIM/month Amount index-regulated. Regulations specify the exact amount.

Scope: Parents or custodians for children for the one year between the age of 16 and 17. No effects on other child benefits.

Example 10:

Country: Finland

Legal Act: Child Benefit's Act (Barnbidragsslag) (1992/796), August 21st 1992.
<http://www.finlex.fi/sv/laki/alkup/1992/19920796>

Item: (Extra) child benefit – age-differentiated 'baby' subsidy (74)

Level: Set to 107 FIM/month for each child relevant for. Amount index-regulated. Regulations specify the exact amount.

Scope: Parents or custodians for children for between the age of 0 and 3.

Typical Measurement Units of Allowances

Amount (National Currency) per day/week/month/year

2. Means-Tested Benefits

Example 1:

Country: Denmark

Legal Act: Child Subsidy and Family Benefit's Act (Lov om børnetilskud og andre familieydelse) (1967/236 as of 1976/531), June 2th 1967. Hard copy.

Instruction: The act contains five different items of child allowances, four of them means-tested such as the following.

Item: Ordinary child allowance – a general child allowance (73)

Levels: Amount set in legislation to 1.566 DKK/year, but amount index-regulated. Regulations specify the exact amount.

Scope: Parents or custodians for children 0-16 years of age, who do not receive raised child allowance, that is, children who do not have single parents. Means testing: Reduced with 6 per cent of all income in family above 110.000 DKK/year.

Example 2:

Country: Denmark

Legal Act: Child Subsidy and Family Benefit's Act (Lov om børnetilskud og andre familieydelse) (1967/236 as of 1976/531), June 2th 1967. Hard copy.

Instruction: The act contains five different items of child allowances, four of them means-tested benefits such as the following.

Item: Special child allowance – a single parent's benefit (74)

Levels: Amount set in legislation to 2.364 DKK/year, but amount index-regulated. Regulations specify the exact amount.

Scope: Parents or custodians for children 0-16 years of age, with either: 1. Single parent or 2. Both parents receive pensions (or under certain circumstances only one of them). Means testing: Reduced with 6 per cent of all income in family above 110.000 DKK/year.

Example 3:

Country: Denmark

Legal Act: Child Subsidy and Family Benefit's Act (Lov om børnetilskud og andre familieydelse) (1967/236 as of 1976/531), June 2th 1967. Hard copy.

Instruction: The act contains five different items of child allowances, four of them means-tested benefits such as the following.

Item: Extra child allowance – an allowance for single parent families (74)

Levels: Amount set in legislation to 1.804 DKK/year. Given only once without regard to number of children.

Scope: Recipients of raised child allowances.

Example 4:

Country: Denmark

Legal Act: Child Subsidy and Family Benefit's Act (Lov om børnetilskud og andre familieydelse) (1967/236 as of 1976/531), June 2th 1967. Hard copy.

Instruction: The act contains five different items of child allowances; four of them means-tested benefits such as the following.

Item: Youth subsidy (74)

Levels: Amount set in legislation to 7.000 DKK/year, but amount index-regulated. Regulations specify the exact amount.

Scope: Means testing: Full subsidy when two requirements simultaneously fulfilled: 1. House income less than 70.000 DKK/year; 2. Child income less than 4.000 DKK/year. In latter case reduced so that there is no subsidy when child income is above 15.000 DKK.

Typical Measurement Units of Means-Tested Benefits

Amount (National Currency) per day/week/month/year.

3. Contribution / Fee

Example 1:

Country: Switzerland

Legal Act: Bundesgesetz vom 25. Juni 1982 über die obligatorische Arbeitslosenversicherung und die Insolvenzenschädigung (Arbeitslosenversicherungsgesetz, AVIG) (http://www.admin.ch/ch/d/sr/c837_0.html)

Item: Unemployment Fee/Contribution (55)

Levels: Art. 3 specifies a contribution rate for the unemployment insurance scheme of **2%** of the previously received income. The income is insured only until a certain maximum level (which in turn constitutes the basis for the calculation of the daily allowances). This maximum level is specified in the legislation regarding the disability insurance.

Scope: In general, employees and wage earner need to insure their income. The payments, however, have to be split between employer and employees. There are 5 exemptions to this rule listed in Art. 2(2) of the legal act.

Example 2:

Country: Switzerland

Legal Act: Bundesgesetz vom 20. Dezember 1946 über die Alters- und Hinterlassenenversicherung (AHVG) (http://www.admin.ch/ch/d/sr/c831_10.html)

Item: Pension Fee/Contribution (55)

Levels: Insured persons whose employer is not dutiable pay a **7,8%** of their income; if the annual income remains below CHF 48300 the percentage gradually decreases until a value of **4,2%** (Art. 6).

Scope: Insured persons are obliged to pay contributions from the age of 20 years on until the age of 64 (women) or 65 (men). Art. 3 specifies four groups of exemptions

Typical Measurement Units of Contributions/Fees

Percentage of salary or income, absolute maximum fees

4. Tax exemption

Example 1:

Country: France

Legal Act: Code général des impôts, Version en vigueur du 1 juillet 1979 au 1 janvier 1981 [Article 194 - ASSIETTE ET LIQUIDATION DE L'IMPOT; IMPOTS D'ETAT; IMPOTS DIRECTS ET TAXES ASSIMILEES; IMPOT SUR LE REVENU; CALCUL DE L'IMPOT] (http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichCodeArticle.do;jsessionid=667A716F3FE5B6D5BCC3ED3C78E2DE9A.tpdjo01v_2?idArticle=LEGIARTI000006308274&cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006069577&dateTexte=19801231)

Item: Tax exemptions (76)

Levels: The law introduces the system of family income splitting in France. Since the tax system is a progressive one this automatically means lower tax brackets for families since each family member is 'assigned' an equal fraction of the sum of a family's income. In practice, this means lower income taxes for families.

In general, the number of fractions is calculated as follows:

- 2 for single (divorced, widowed etc.) or married persons with income having 1 child
- 2,5 for single (divorced, widowed etc.) or married persons with income having 2 children
- 3 for single (divorced, widowed etc.) or married persons with income having 3 children
- 3,5 for single (divorced, widowed etc.) or married persons with income having 4 children

Scope: The legislative act (Art. 196) specifies a ceiling of this reduction in taxes which is F 6000 for income earned in 1974, F 6700 for income earned in 1975, F 7300 income earned in 1976, F 7900 income earned in 1977, F 8600 income earned in 1978.

Typical Measurement Units (Level)

Directly via absolute reduction in taxes (i.e., percentage reduction); or indirectly via reduction of taxable income, e.g. by factors (see above); or by reducing/specifying the taxable basis in absolute terms.

5. Bonus/ grant

Example 1:

Country: Switzerland

Legal Act: Bundesgesetz vom 25. Juni 1982 über die obligatorische Arbeitslosenversicherung und die Insolvenzenschädigung (Arbeitslosenversicherungsgesetz, AVIG) (http://www.admin.ch/ch/d/sr/c837_0.html)

Item: Reimbursement of expenses related to active job search (60)

Levels: Insured persons can apply for **reimbursement of commuter and other expenses** (Art. 59). See also Art. 65-71).

Scope: Persons that are registered as unemployed and that fall under the unemployment benefit scheme.

Typical Measurement Units (Levels)

Limit of financial support (in absolute value)

6. Retention

Example 1:

Country: Switzerland

Legal Act: Bundesgesetz vom 25. Juni 1982 über die obligatorische Arbeitslosenversicherung und die Insolvenzenschädigung (Arbeitslosenversicherungsgesetz, AVIG) (http://www.admin.ch/ch/d/sr/c837_0.html)

Item: Retention period (57)

Levels: Art. 18 states a retention period of 5 days of controlled (that is, ‘registered’) unemployment.

Scope: This waiting period applies to every insured person that fulfils the eligibility criteria for receiving unemployment benefits (see above).

Typical Measurement Units

Time period (days, weeks, months etc.)

5. Coder Checklist

This is a checklist of issues to be aware of when coding the legislative data. It is intended to provide a quick summary of the coding instructions. For more information, please refer to chapter 3 of these coding instructions as well as the annex, which contains the an overview of the numerical codes that we ask the coders to use.

No 1: Make sure that you always approach the data coding in terms of measuring policy change. **We are not interested in absolute values but always in their change over time.**

No 2: Check whether the text is a **national provision**. Do not code provisions by subnational entities.

No 3: Check whether the text was adopted during the observation period (**January 1, 1976 to December 31, 2005**). Do not code texts that were adopted prior to or after this period.

No 4: Check whether the text entails regulations relevant to the **three subcategories defined for environmental policy (i.e. clean air policy, water protection, and nature conservation)**, or if you are coding social policy whether the text entails regulations relevant to the **three subcategories defined for social policy (unemployment, pensions, child benefits)**

No 5: Read through the legal text, mark **all events of policy change** in the provided Microsoft excel spreadsheet and indicate the respective coding categories (**policy item, policy instrument, setting (level and scope)**). Use the **numerical codes** provided in chapter 3 as well as the appendix.

No 6: Follow exactly the definition of policy items in this manual. Some items are defined in a narrower manner than others. In case of less specific policy items, **any application of the policy item, e.g. for various industries, must be coded.**

No 7: As concerns the numerical codes for policy instruments, **please try to use any other category than “other”**. This category should only be applied if the policy instrument in question really does not fit into any of the predefined categories.

No 8: Determine whether these events of policy change represent **activities of expansion or dismantling**. For each event, you need to know whether a policy item, a policy instrument, and the precise level/scope did already exist before. On the basis of this information, make a qualified decision whether the event represents an instance of expansion or dismantling. In other words, **make sure that you consider the complete legislative history for judging the direction of policy change**.

No 9: For each single event, fill in **all columns** of the excel sheet. This implies to follow the **“hierarchical structure”** of the data, which has policy items as the first category, policy instruments as the second category, regulatory level as the third, and regulatory scope as the fourth category. Make sure that you consider each of these four categories and code them accordingly. **Please note that no missings are allowed (only “na”, meaning not applicable)**.

No 10: Make sure that with regard to the coding categories regulatory level/scope you also give **values for the current as well as previous levels and scopes**. In this context, it is highly important to **make clear statements about the measurement units**. Please be as precise as possible when coding these two categories. **Please indicate both: the current and the previous reference value as well as the measurement unit**.

No 11: **The level and the scope categories must refer to exactly one instrument**. However, it may be the case that an event of policy change entails an instrument that cannot clearly or exclusively be assigned one specific type. If these cases, please consider the most **dominant parts of the instrument when assigning a type**.

No 12: As concerns coding **changes in the regulatory scope** the coders should make sure only code the actual **change**, i.e. in comparison with the previous regulatory scope. In case of newly introduced policy items or instruments there is no previous scope and “na” needs to be filled in. Most importantly **this event of change has no direction, thus “na” needs to be filled in for the direction column**.

No 13: Any change in each category (item, instrument, level, and scope) represents one event of policy change and need to be filled in separately in a new row of the excel sheet. **Please remember the “hierarchy” of the data structure. When coding an instrument please indicate the item it refers to. In a similar vein, when coding a level or a scope please indicate the instrument as well as the item it refers to.**

References

Allan, James P. and Lyle, Scruggs (2004). Political Partisanship and Welfare State Reform in Advanced Industrial Societies, *American Journal of Political Science* 48 (3): 496-512.

Guderian, Robert (ed.) (2001). *Terrestrische Ökosysteme: Wirkungen auf Pflanzen, Diagnose und Überwachung, Wirkungen auf Tiere*. Berlin: Springer.

Guderian, Robert and Günter Gunkel (eds.) (2000). *Aquatische Systeme: Grundlagen – Physikalische Belastungsfaktoren – Anorganische Stoffeinträge*. Berlin: Springer.

Lovei, Magda (1998). *Phasing Out Lead from Gasoline. Worldwide Experience and Policy Implications* (World Bank Technical Paper No. 397). Washington, D.C.: The World Bank.

APPENDIX

A Bibliographical Information

The coders should give the bibliographical information in the following form.

Heading

Country: e.g. Germany
Policy Area: e.g. Social Policy
Name of the Coder:

For Printed Resources

Author, Year, Titel, Publisher (Books)

Author, Year, Titel, Journal, Volume, Pages (Journals)

For Electronic Resources

Internet address, date of accession, language

B Data Spreadsheet

The spreadsheet provides a template for how the coded data should be presented to the project consortium. The coders are asked set up a table in Microsoft excel, which they should hand in to the responsible project partners after completing the coding exercise. The following table outlines the general appearance of the table. Ideally, the coders should use one spreadsheet for each policy subfield. For a homogenous appearance of the sheets, we have developed the **template files consensus_env.exe and consensus_soc.exe**, which we will distribute among the coders.

The remaining two tables are based on actual environmental and social policy legislation to give the coders a feeling for how they should fill in the single cells. **The coders should keep in mind that each event of policy change must be inserted into exactly one line of the table.** The numerical codes for each single column are given in the next section.

Example 1: Copper from industrial discharges from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water in Mexico

ID	Country	Day	Month	Year	Medium	Legal Act	Item No.	Instrument No.	Level previous	Level current	Scope previous	Scope current	Coding category	Direction	Remarks
14	MX	29	7	1988	22	NTE-CCA-001/88	32	na	na	na	na	na	1	1	
14	MX	29	7	1988	22	NTE-CCA-001/88	32	101	na	na	na	na	2	1	
14	MX	29	7	1988	22	NTE-CCA-001/88	32	101	na	1 mg/l	na	na	3	1	
14	MX	29	7	1988	22	NTE-CCA-001/88	32	101	na	na	na	1 industry (thermoelectric centrals)	4	1	
14	MX	29	7	1988	22	NTE-CCA-014/88	32	na	na	na	na	na	1	1	
14	MX	29	7	1988	22	NTE-CCA-014/88	32	101	na	na	na	na	2	1	
14	MX	29	7	1988	22	NTE-CCA-014/88	32	101	na	1 mg/l	na	na	3	1	
14	MX	29	7	1988	22	NTE-CCA-014/88	32	101	na	na	na	1 industry (textiles)	4	1	
14	MX	29	7	1988	22	NTE-CCA-017/88	32	na	na	na	na	na	1	1	
14	MX	29	7	1988	22	NTE-CCA-017/88	32	101	na	na	na	na	2	1	
14	MX	29	7	1988	22	NTE-CCA-017/88	32	101	na	0.5 mg/l	na	na	3	1	
14	MX	29	7	1988	22	NTE-CCA-017/88	32	101	na	na	na	1 industry (metal forming)	4	1	

14	MX	29	7	1988	22	NTE-CCA-018/88	32	na	na	na	na	na	1	1	
14	MX	29	7	1988	22	NTE-CCA-018/88	32	101	na	na	na	na	2	1	
14	MX	29	7	1988	22	NTE-CCA-018/88	32	101	na	1 mg/l	na	na	3	1	
14	MX	29	7	1988	22	NTE-CCA-018/88	32	101	na	na	na	1 industry (lamination)	4	1	
14	MX	18	10	1993	22	NOM-CCA-001-ECOL/93	32	na	na	na	ns	na	1	0	
14	MX	18	10	1993	22	NOM-CCA-001-ECOL/93	32	101	na	na	na	na	2	0	
14	MX	18	10	1993	22	NOM-CCA-001-ECOL/93	32	101	1 mg/l	0.8 mg/l	na	na	3	1	
14	MX	18	10	1993	22	NOM-CCA-001-ECOL/93	32	101	na	na	na	1 industry (thermoelectric centrals)	4	0	
14	MX	18	10	1993	22	NOM-CCA-014-ECOL/93	32	na	na	na	na	na	1	2	
14	MX	18	10	1993	22	NOM-CCA-014-ECOL/93	32	101	na	na	na	na	2	2	
14	MX	18	10	1993	22	NOM-CCA-014-ECOL/93	32	101	1 mg/l	no limit value anymore	na	na	3	2	
14	MX	18	10	1993	22	NOM-CCA-014-ECOL/93	32	101	na	na	1 industry (textiles)	not regulated anymore	4	2	
14	MX	18	10	1993	22	NOM-CCA-017-ECOL/93	32	na	na	na	na	na	1	0	
14	MX	18	10	1993	22	NOM-CCA-017-ECOL/93	32	101	na	na	na	na	2	0	
14	MX	18	10	1993	22	NOM-CCA-017-ECOL/93	32	101	0.5 mg/l	0.5 mg/l	na	na	3	0	

14	MX	18	10	1993	22	NOM-CCA-017-ECOL/93	32	101	na	na	1 industry (metal forming)	1 industry (metal forming)	4	0	
14	MX	18	10	1993	22	NOM-CCA-018-ECOL/93	32	na	na	na	na	na	1	0	
14	MX	18	10	1993	22	NOM-CCA-018-ECOL/93	32	101	na	na	na	na	2	0	
14	MX	18	10	1993	22	NOM-CCA-018-ECOL/93	32	101	1 mg/l	1 mg/l	na	na	3	0	
14	MX	18	10	1993	22	NOM-CCA-018-ECOL/93	32	101	na	na	1 industry (lamination)	1 industry (lamination)	4	0	
14	MX	6	1	1995	22	NOM-CCA-066-ECOL/94	32	na	na	na	na	na	1	1	
14	MX	6	1	1995	22	NOM-CCA-066-ECOL/94	32	101	na	na	na	na	2	1	
14	MX	6	1	1995	22	NOM-CCA-066-ECOL/94	32	101	na	0.5 mg/l	na	na	3	1	
14	MX	6	1	1995	22	NOM-CCA-066-ECOL/94	32	101	na	na	na	1 industry (galvanoplastics)	4	1	
14	MX	6	1	1995	22	NOM-CCA-069-ECOL/94	32	na	na	na	na	na	1	1	
14	MX	6	1	1995	22	NOM-CCA-069-ECOL/94	32	101	na	na	na	na	2	1	
14	MX	6	1	1995	22	NOM-CCA-069-ECOL/94	32	101	na	1 mg/l	na	na	3	1	
14	MX	6	1	1995	22	NOM-CCA-069-ECOL/94	32	101	na	na	na	1 industry (electronics)	4	1	
14	MX	6	1	1995	22	NOM-CCA-071-ECOL/94	32	na	na	na	na	na	1	1	
14	MX	6	1	1995	22	NOM-CCA-071-ECOL/94	32	101	na	na	na	na	2	1	
14	MX	6	1	1995	22	NOM-CCA-071-ECOL/94	32	101	na	0.2 mg/l	na	na	3	1	

14	MX	6	1	1995	22	NOM-CCA-071- ECOL/94	32	101	na	na	na	1 industry (acids)	4	1	
14	MX	7	1	1997	22	NOM-001- ECOL-1996	32	101	na	na	na	na	1	0	
14	MX	7	1	1997	22	NOM-001- ECOL-1996	32	101	na	na	na	na	2	0	
14	MX	7	1	1997	22	NOM-001- ECOL-1996	32	101	na	na	0.2- 1 mg/l	6 mg/l	3	2	
14	MX	7	1	1997	22	NOM-001- ECOL-1996	32	101	na	na	7 sectors	all sectors	4	1	

Example 2: Child Benefit Regulation in France

ID	Country	Day	Month	Year	Medium	Legal Act	Item No.	Instrument No.	Level previous	Level current	Scope previous	Scope current	Coding category	Direction	Remarks
7	FR	4	11	1996	6	Décret no 96-963	74	203	na	na	Households in DOMs with 1 or more children under 5 years	Households in DOMs with 1 child/children over 3 and (at least one) under 5 years	4	1	Houshold (not child) allowance
7	FR	29	12	1997	6	Décret no 97-1245	73	201	na	na	Eligibility criteria for child benefits: <18 years	Eligibility criteria for child benefits: <19 years	4	1	
7	FR	29	12	1998	6	Décret no 98-1213	74	203	na	na	Children eligible for additional payments if aged <10	Children eligible for additional payments if aged <11	4	1	
7	FR	29	12	1998	6	Décret no 98-1213	74	203	na	na	No additional payments for teenagers	Children eligible for additional payments if aged >16	4	1	
7	FR	29	12	1998	6	Décret no 98-1213	73	201	na	na	Eligibility criteria for child benefits: <19 years	Eligibility criteria for child benefits: <20 years	4	1	
7	FR	28	06	1998	6	Décret no 99-536	74	204	Formula for additional payments for parents not earning a fixed wage = ceiling – 2028*hourly minimum wage	Formula for additional payments for parents not earning a fixed wage = ceiling – 1500*hourly minimum wage	na	na	3	1	
7	FR	15	11	1999	6	Loi no 99-	74	201	na	na	Eligible for	Eligible for	4	2	

						944					receiving child benefits are single mothers or fathers responsible for children, orphans etc.; expiration of claim in case of marriage only	receiving child benefits are single mothers or fathers responsible for children, orphans etc.; expiration of claim in case of marriage or cohabitation			
--	--	--	--	--	--	-----	--	--	--	--	---	--	--	--	--

C Numerical Codes

As a rule, for each and every coding activity, the coders are asked to provide as much information as possible as concerns the columns!!! If a certain column cannot be filled in since it is not applicable, we ask the coders to insert “na”.

ID = Identification number of each single country

ID	Country	ID	Country
1	Australia	13	Korea
2	Austria	14	Mexico
3	Belgium	15	Netherlands
4	Canada	16	New Zealand
5	Denmark	17	Norway
6	Finland	18	Portugal
7	France	19	Spain
8	Germany	20	Sweden
9	Greece	21	Switzerland
10	Ireland	22	Turkey
11	Italy	23	United Kingdom
12	Japan	24	United States

Country = Official country short names as defined by ISO

ISO Abbreviation	Country	ISO Abbreviation	Country
AU	Australia	KR	Korea
AT	Austria	MX	Mexico
BE	Belgium	NL	Netherlands
CA	Canada	NZ	New Zealand
DK	Denmark	NO	Norway
FI	Finland	PT	Portugal
FR	France	ES	Spain
DE	Germany	SE	Sweden
GR	Greece	CH	Switzerland

IE	Ireland	TR	Turkey
IT	Italy	GB	United Kingdom
JP	Japan	US	United States

Day = Day of Adoption (as stated in the legal act)

The date should always be given in the following form DD, e.g. 01

Month = Month of Adoption (as stated in the legal act)

The date should always be given in the following form MM, e.g. 05

Year = Year of Adoption (as stated in the legal act)

The date should always be given in the following form YYYY, e.g. 1978

Medium = Indicates the sub-dimensions of environmental and social policy

Environmental Policy:

Clean Air Policy

- 11 – Air quality
- 12 – Emission limits (from stationary or mobile sources; product standards)

Water Protection

- 21 – Water quality
- 22 – Emission limits (from stationary or mobile sources; product standards)

Nature Conservation

- 31 – Habitat (landscaping and protected areas)
- 32 – Flora (plant protection and forests)
- 33 – Fauna (animal protection and hunting)

Social Policy:

- 4 – Unemployment Benefits Policy
- 5 – Pensions Policy
- 6 – Child Benefits Policy

Legal Act = Complete name of the legal act

Example: Conservation Act 1987

Item = Number given to the policy items in chapter 3.1

Environmental Policy

Policy Item	Numerical Code
Air quality standards for nitrogen oxides (NOx)	1
Air quality standards for sulphur dioxide (SO ₂)	2
Air quality standards for carbon monoxide (CO)	3
Air quality standards for particulate matter	4
Air quality standards for ozone	5
Air quality standards for lead	6
Nitrogen oxides (NOx) emissions from large combustion plants of the smallest size as defined by the legal act. Those are generally but not exclusively combustion plants with a thermal output of about 50 MW	7
Nitrogen oxides (NOx) emissions from passenger vehicles using unleaded gasoline	8
Nitrogen oxides (NOx) emissions from heavy vehicles destined for the transportation of goods using diesel	9
Sulphur dioxide (SO ₂) emissions from large combustion plants of the smallest size as defined by the legal act. Those are generally but not exclusively combustion plants with a thermal output of about 50 MW	10
Sulphur dioxide (SO ₂) emissions from passenger vehicles using unleaded gasoline	11
Sulphur dioxide (SO ₂) emissions from heavy vehicles destined for the transportation of goods using diesel	12
Carbon dioxide (CO ₂) emissions from large combustion plants of the smallest size as defined by the legal act. Those are generally but not exclusively combustion plants with a thermal output of about 50 MW	13
Carbon dioxide (CO ₂) emissions from passenger vehicles using unleaded gasoline	14
Carbon mono oxide (CO) emissions from large combustion plants of the smallest size as defined by the legal act. Those are generally but not exclusively combustion plants with a thermal output of about 50 MW	15
Carbon mono oxide (CO) emissions from passenger vehicles using unleaded gasoline	16
Particulate matter emissions from large combustion plants of the smallest size as defined by the legal act. Those are generally but not exclusively combustion plants with a thermal output of about 50	17

MW	
Arsenic emissions from stationary sources	18
Maximum permissible limit for the lead content of petrol	19
Maximum permissible limit for the sulphur content of diesel	20
Lead in continental surfaces water	21
Copper in continental surfaces water	22
Nitrates in continental surfaces water	23
Phosphates in continental surfaces water	24
Zinc in continental surfaces water	25
Oils in continental surfaces water	26
Pesticides in continental surfaces water	27
DDT (Dichloro-Diphenyl-Trichloroethane) in continental surfaces water	28
Phenols in continental surfaces water	29
BOD (Biochemical Oxygen Demand) of continental surfaces water	30
Lead from industrial discharges from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water	31
Copper from industrial discharges from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water	32
Nitrates from industrial discharges from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water	33
Phosphates from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water	34
Chlorides from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water	35
Sulphates from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water	36
Iron from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water	37
Zinc from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water	38
Oils and greases from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water	39
Pesticides and herbicides from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water	40
Phenols from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water	41
Coliform bacteria from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water	42
BOD (Biochemical Oxygen Demand) from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water	43
COD (Chemical Oxygen Demand) from industrial discharges into continental surfaces water	44
Measures to protect native forests	45
The introduction/ extension/ reduction of nature protection areas/nature reserve	46
The introduction/ extension/ reduction of import and export of regulations for endangered plants	47
The introduction/ extension/ reduction of import and export of regulations for endangered species	48

Social Policy

Policy Item	Numerical Code
Basic Unemployment benefits	49

Special Unemployment benefits: bad weather; seasonal unemployment benefits	50
Special Unemployment benefits: emergency aid	51
Special Unemployment benefits: special holiday payments	52
Special Unemployment benefits: partial unemployment benefits	53
Special Unemployment benefits (Only to be considered if the more special forms of special unemployment benefits do not apply)	54
Unemployment fee/ contribution	55
Support for vocational education and training/ vocational reintegration expenses	56
Retention period (in case of quitting by the employee), i.e. a period of quarantine without benefits	57
Retention period (dismissal by the employer), i.e. a period of quarantine without benefits	58
Subsidized employment/ employment subsidies	59
Reimbursement of expenses related to active job search	60
People's Pension (standard-employee pension) for singles	61
People's Pension (standard-employee pension) for married couples	62
People's Pension (standard-employee pension) for unmarried couples	63
Additional People's Pension for singles	64
Additional People's Pension for married couples	65
Additional People's Pension for unmarried couples	66
Special Pensions for singles	67
Special Pensions for married couples	68
Special Pensions for unmarried couples	69
Pension fee/ contribution for singles	70
Pension fee/ contribution for married couples	71
Pension fee/ contribution for unmarried couples	72
Ordinary Child Allowance	73
Special child allowance, e.g. special subsidy for juveniles having not reached majority (often 16-18 years)	74
Payments for giving birth to children	75
Tax exemptions	76

Instrument = Numbers given to the policy instruments in chapter 3.2

Environmental Policy

Instrument	Description	Examples	Code
Obligatory standard	A legally enforceable numerical standard, typically involving a measurement units,	Limit value for lead emissions in surface water, e.g. 50 mg/l	101

	e.g. mg/l		
Prohibition/ ban	Total or partial prohibition/ ban on certain emissions, activities, products etc.	Ban on importation of products containing flurochlorocarbons; ban on exportation of endangered species	102
Technological prescription	A measure prescribing the use of a specific technique or technology	best available technology', or 'best practicable means'	103
Tax/ levy	A tax or levy for a certain polluting product or activity	levy on the emission of a certain pollutant into surface waters, e.g. copper	104
Subsidy/ tax reduction	A measure by which the state grants a financial advantage to a certain product or activity	the use of less air-polluting cars	105
Liability scheme	A measure that allocates the costs of environmental damage to those who have caused the damage	"polluter pays principle"	106
Planning instrument	Most rampant is spatial planning	zoning of activities around airports or sensitive ecosystems	107
Public investment	Specific public investment	Pubic investment for the research and development of new energy technologies	108
Data collection / monitoring programmes	Specific programme for collecting data	monitoring of urban air quality in the context of an early warning system for photochemical smog; monitoring of the population of certain endangered species	109
Information based instrument	Exchange of information between the state and polluters or between polluters among themselves	pollutant release and transfer register	110
Voluntary instrument	Voluntary agreements	greenhouse	111

	or commitments between the state and private actors or by private actors alone	reduction targets, e.g. a reduction of emissions by 10%	
Other	Any instrument that cannot be assigned to the given categories		112

Social Policy

Instrument	Description	Example	Code
Universal benefits/ Allowance	A payment of a certain amount of money by the state, irrespective of means	Unemployment benefit, Child benefit; orphan's benefit	201
Means-tested benefits	The entitlement depends on several factors, such as income	Single parent's benefit; youth subsidy	202
Contribution/ fee	Payment made by citizens to a state agency in order to receive certain benefits	Fee for unemployment insurance	203
Tax exemption/ subsidy	A reduction of tax payments in order to provide income tax savings	Child Tax Exemption	204
Bonus/ grant	one-off grant/ payment of money, irrespective of means	Bonus for giving birth to a child; reimbursement of expenses related to job search	205
Retention	Non-payment of a certain allowance	Retention period for unemployment benefit	206
Other	Any instrument that cannot be assigned to the given categories		207

Level previous = Precise level of the instrument levels given by numerical values and measurement units at the previous time of regulation (see chapter 3.3)

Example: 150 mg/l

Level current = Precise level of the instrument levels given by numerical values and measurement units at the current point in time (see chapter 3.3)

Example: 100 mg/l

Scope previous = Coverage of the regulation at the previous point in time (see chapter 3.3)

Example: subset of regulatees

Scope previous = Coverage of the regulation at the current point in time (see chapter 3.3)

Example: All regulatees

Coding Category = Distinguishes between the give analytical categories, i.e. policy items, instruments, regulatory levels, and regulatory scope

- 1 – Policy Item
- 2 – Policy Instrument
- 3 – Regulatory Level
- 4 – Regulatory Scope

Direction = Indicates whether it is an event of policy expansion or dismantling

- 0 – Status Quo
- 1 – Expansion
- 2 – Dismantling

Remarks = Enables communication with the project teams

Please only use this column only if it is really necessary